



Town of Wayland Massachusetts

Finance Committee

- Tom Abdella
- Carol Martin
- Gil Wolin
- Nancy Funkhouser, Chair
- Bill Steinberg
- David Watkins
- Gordon Cliff

REVISED AGENDA

Wednesday, September 16, 2015, 7:00 pm.
Town Building

Note: Items may not be discussed in the order listed or at the specific time estimated. The meeting may be broadcast and videotaped for later broadcast by WayCAM and may be recorded by others.

- 7:00 Call to Order
- 7:01 Public Comment & Members' Response to Public Comment
- 7:10 Health Insurance Update and Discussion, John Senchyshyn
- 7:40 Fall 2015 STM
Discussion of STM article drafts
Possible update and article vote on Current Year Transfer and Prior Year Unpaid Bills articles.
- 8:30 FY17 Operating Budget Guideline Memo Discussion
- 8:45 Liaison & Members' Reports, Concerns, and Topics
Overlay/Board of Assessor's Update
- 9:00 Chair's Update
8-31-15 Draft Minutes review and vote
Items the chair did not reasonably anticipate would be discussed at the meeting
Meeting Schedule: 9/28/15, 10/5/15 (tentative meeting), 10/19/15
Newspaper Article Possibility - Discussion
- 9:15 Adjourn

DATE: September 8, 2015

TO: Board of Selectmen, School Committee and Personnel Board

FROM: John Senchyshyn, Asst. Town Administrator/HR Director

RE: **Joint Meeting with the Personnel Board and the School Committee to Hear an Analysis and Discuss Potential Options with Cook and Company for Providing Health Insurance to Employees and Retirees through the Group Insurance Commission**

REQUESTED MOTION:

None

BACKGROUND:

At its meeting of August 3rd, the Board of Selectmen authorized the engagement of Cook & Co. to conduct a comparative analysis of premiums between the West Suburban Health Group (WSHG) and the Group Insurance Commission (GIC) and identify potential premium cost savings between the organizations. Sue Shillue, President of Cook & Co. will be presenting the findings to the boards. I anticipate a 15 minute presentation followed by a 30 minute Q&A. Included in the packet are a number of documents applicable to the presentation. The documents are as follows:

- An introductory letter regarding the analysis
- FY 16 GIC total premium rates and FY 16 WSHG total premium rates
- Comparisons of WSHG and GIC Medicare and Non-Medicare plan designs
- A Summary and supporting projections for potential employee/retiree migration with corresponding premium savings
- Projected annual effects on employees/retirees resulting from a combination of premium savings and increased out-of-pocket expenses

A number of the aforementioned scenarios and projections focus on the Tufts Navigator plan, the Harvard Pilgrim Independence plan and the Harvard Pilgrim Primary Choice plan. These three plans are the most popular plans with municipal employees enrolled in the GIC. They represent 26.8%, 21.3% and 10.7% of the total municipal enrollment respectively.

Should the Town opt to pursue the GIC option, the first step in the process would be the adoption of M.G.L. 32B, Sections 21-23 by the Board of Selectmen. Such a vote requires a minimum 2-day notification to the bargaining units and the state's retirees' association. There are then a number of steps spelled out in the law which includes the creation of a Public Employees Committee (PEC). 25% of the total first year's savings is provided to the employees and retirees in mitigation. Mitigation is limited to the first year. The Town and the PEC bargain over the distribution or application of the mitigation funds, but not over the decision to move to the GIC. The GIC requires notification by December 1st for a July 1st enrollment. The time frame to meet a December 1st notification is very tight.



COOK & COMPANY
Insurance Services, Inc.

August 25, 2015

Mr. John Senchyshyn
Assistant Town Administrator
Town of Wayland
41 Cochituate Road
Wayland, MA 01778

Dear John:

We have evaluated the Town of Wayland's health insurance program under the West Suburban Health Group (WSHG) versus the Group Insurance Commission (GIC) and are providing the following information:

1. A benefit comparison of the WSHG health plans versus the GIC health plans (both active and Medicare plans).
2. List of the networks for each limited network plan in the GIC.
3. A financial comparison of the premiums costs (total as well as employer/employee split) for the current WSHG plans and enrollments and the projected GIC costs based on different migration assumptions.
4. A copy of the GIC municipal regulations.

Currently the WSHG retiree plans offer prescription drug coverage through a Medicare Prescription Drug Plan. This is in lieu of the Retiree Drug Subsidy (RDS) that the group previously obtained. As of 1-1-16, the GIC's Medicare indemnity plan (Unicare OME) will also offer their prescription drug plan in the same manner. Therefore, the premiums for that plan (which is the plan that most closely resembles Medex), will be reduced. However, since we don't yet know the new rates, I have not built the reduction into the projection. One additional benefit to these types of plans is that they reduce the town's OPEB liability.

Some points regarding the GIC:

1. You will no longer negotiate benefit levels with the unions. The GIC decides what the carriers, plans, benefits, copayments, etc. will be.
2. The Town would negotiate with a Public Employee Committee (PEC) either through Section 19 or Sections 21-23 to enter the GIC. The Town's initial agreement must be for either 3 or 6 years. Subsequent agreements can be for no less than 2 years. If the Town opts out of the GIC after the expiration of an agreement, you can't enroll again for 3 years.

Mr. John Senchyshyn
August 25, 2015
Page Two

3. The Town is able to obtain their specific utilization one time prior to the expiration of the PEC agreement. The information that you can obtain is specified in the GIC regulations.
4. The WSHG currently provides a prescription drug program through CanaRx whereby members can obtain prescription drugs with no copayment. This program is not offered through the GIC. In addition, the WSHG offers wellness programs that would not be offered through the GIC.

Please let me know if you need have any questions regarding this information. I look forward to presenting it to the Board of Selectmen and School Committee.

Sincerely,

COOK & COMPANY INSURANCE SERVICES, INC.



Susan H. Shillue
President



Insurance products from the people you trust

GIC MONTHLY FULL COST RATES

Effective July 1, 2015

Full Cost Rates Including the 0.4% Administrative Fee

! For the rate you will pay as a municipal employee or retiree/survivor, see separate rate chart from your municipality or the GIC's website: www.mass.gov/gic/munirates.

Employee and Non-Medicare Retiree/Survivor Health Plans

HEALTH PLAN	PLAN TYPE	INDIVIDUAL	FAMILY
Fallon Health Direct Care	HMO	\$492.89	\$1,182.96
Fallon Health Select Care	HMO	654.98	1,571.91
Harvard Pilgrim Independence Plan	POS	749.39	1,828.49
Harvard Pilgrim Primary Choice Plan	HMO	599.51	1,462.80
Health New England	HMO	494.17	1,225.14
NHP Prime (<i>Neighborhood Health Plan</i>)	HMO	470.71	1,247.36
Tufts Health Plan Navigator	POS	659.25	1,609.60
Tufts Health Plan Spirit	HMO-type	501.40	1,207.85
UniCare State Indemnity Plan/Basic with CIC (Comprehensive)	Indemnity	974.65	2,281.72
UniCare State Indemnity Plan/Basic without CIC (Non-Comprehensive)	Indemnity	932.32	2,183.55
UniCare State Indemnity Plan/Community Choice	PPO-type	472.29	1,136.29
UniCare State Indemnity Plan/PLUS	PPO-type	655.64	1,566.91

Medicare Plans

Health Plan	Plan Type	Per Person
Fallon Senior Plan*	Medicare (<i>HMO</i>)	\$302.13
Harvard Pilgrim Medicare Enhance	Medicare (<i>Indemnity</i>)	392.24
Health New England MedPlus	Medicare (<i>HMO</i>)	360.95
Tufts Health Plan Medicare Complement	Medicare (<i>HMO</i>)	353.91
Tufts Health Plan Medicare Preferred*	Medicare (<i>HMO</i>)	275.60
UniCare State Indemnity Plan/Medicare Extension (OME) with CIC (<i>Comprehensive</i>)	Medicare (<i>Indemnity</i>)	403.98
UniCare State Indemnity Plan/Medicare Extension (OME) without CIC (<i>Non-Comprehensive</i>)	Medicare (<i>Indemnity</i>)	393.47

**Benefits and rates of Fallon Senior Plan and Tufts Health Plan Medicare Preferred are subject to federal approval and may change January 1, 2016.*

WEST SUBURBAN HEALTH GROUP

Non-Medicare Plan Rates effective July 1, 2015

Health Plans	Plan Type	FY 16	
		Monthly Rate	
		Individual	Family
HPHC PPO	PPO	\$ 2,268.00	\$ 5,036.00
HPHC Rate Saver	HMO	\$ 736.00	\$ 1,918.00
Blue Choice Rate Saver	HMO	\$ 843.00	\$ 2,261.00
Tufts Navigator Rate Saver	HMO	\$ 797.00	\$ 2,088.00
Fallon Select Rate Saver	HMO	\$ 611.00	\$ 1,647.00
Fallon Direct Rate Saver	HMO	\$ 570.00	\$ 1,531.00

Medicare Plan Rates effective January 1, 2015

Health Plans		CY15	
		Monthly Rate	
		Individual	
BCBS Medex	MEDICARE INDEMNITY	\$ 340.00	
HPHC Medicare Enhance	MEDICARE INDEMNITY	\$ 328.33	
Managed Blue for Seniors	MEDICARE HMO	\$ 295.63	
Fallon Senior Plan	MEDICARE HMO	\$ 299.00	
Tufts Medicare Prime Supplement	MEDICARE INDEMNITY	\$ 330.00	
Tufts Medicare Preferred HMO	MEDICARE HMO	\$ 262.00	

COMPARISON OF WSHG RATE SAVER PLANS VS WSHG CURRENT BENCHMARK PLANS FY '16

	WSHG RATE SAVER PLANS				WSHG BENCHMARK PLANS			
	WSHG HPHC RATE SAVER HMO	WSHG TUFTS RATE SAVER HMO	WSHG NETWORK BLUE RATE SAVER HMO	FALLON RATE SAVER HMO	WSHG HPHC BENCHMARK HMO	WSHG TUFTS BENCHMARK HMO	WSHG NETWORK BLUE BENCHMARK HMO	WSHG FALLON BENCHMARK HMO
Calendar Year Deductible	IND FAM	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$250 \$750	\$250 \$750	\$250 \$750
Primary Care Office Visit	Tier 1 Tier 2 Tier 3	\$20	\$15 \$25 \$45	\$20	\$20	\$20	\$20	\$20
Specialist Office Visit	Tier 1 Tier 2 Tier 3	\$35 N/A N/A	\$45 N/A N/A	\$35 N/A N/A	\$25 \$35 \$45	\$35 N/A N/A	\$35 N/A N/A	\$35 N/A N/A
Emergency Room		\$75	\$75	\$75	\$100	\$75	\$100	\$100
Hospital Admission	Tier 1 Tier 2 Tier 3	\$250 N/A N/A	\$250 \$500 \$500	\$250 N/A N/A	\$300 \$300 \$700	\$300 \$700 N/A	\$300 \$700 N/A	\$300 N/A N/A
Hospital Outpatient Surgery		\$125	\$150 \$250 \$250	\$125	\$150	\$150	\$150	\$150
High Tech Imaging (MRI, CT, PET)	Tier 1 Tier 2 Tier 3	Covered in Full	\$75 \$150 \$150	Covered in Full	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$100
Prescriptions								
Retail								
30-day supply	Tier 1 Tier 2 Tier 3	\$10 \$25 \$45	\$15 \$30 \$50	\$10 \$25 \$45	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$15 \$30 \$50	\$10 \$25 \$50
Mail Order								
90-day supply	Tier 1 Tier 2 Tier 3	\$20 \$50 \$90	\$30 \$60 \$100	\$20 \$50 \$90	\$20 \$50 \$110	\$20 \$50 \$110	\$20 \$50 \$110	\$20 \$50 \$110

**COMPARISON OF WSHG MEDICARE PLANS VS GIC MEDICARE PLANS
FY '16**

WSHG MEDICARE PLANS										GIC MEDICARE PLANS														
MEDEX	HPHC ENHANCE	TUFTS MEDICARE SUPPLEMENT	TUFTS MEDICARE PREFERRED	MANAGED BLUE FOR SENIORS	FALLON SENIOR	GIC UNICARE ONE	GIC HPHC ENHANCE	GIC TUFTS COMPLEMENT	GIC TUFTS PREFERRED	GIC FALLON SENIOR	GIC HEALTH NEW ENGLAND	MEDEX	HPHC ENHANCE	TUFTS MEDICARE SUPPLEMENT	TUFTS MEDICARE PREFERRED	MANAGED BLUE FOR SENIORS	FALLON SENIOR	GIC UNICARE ONE	GIC HPHC ENHANCE	GIC TUFTS COMPLEMENT	GIC TUFTS PREFERRED	GIC FALLON SENIOR	GIC HEALTH NEW ENGLAND	
Calendar Year Deductible	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$35	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Office Visit	Covered in Full	\$5	\$10	\$10	\$15	Covered in Full	\$10	Covered in Full	\$10	\$15	Covered in Full	\$10	Covered in Full	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$15	Covered in Full	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$10
Specialist Office Visit	Covered in Full	\$5	\$10	\$10	\$25	Covered in Full	\$10	Covered in Full	\$15	\$25	Covered in Full	\$10	Covered in Full	\$10	\$15	\$25	Covered in Full	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$10	\$10
Emergency Room	Covered in Full	\$30	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$25	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50	\$50
Hospital Admission	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	\$50 (max of one per quarter)	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	\$300 deductible	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full	Covered in Full
Prescriptions																								
Retail 30-day supply	Tier 1 \$5 Tier 2 \$15 Tier 3 \$30	\$5 \$10 \$25	\$10 \$20 \$35	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$5 \$15 \$30	\$10 \$30 \$60	\$10 \$20 \$35	\$10 \$20 \$35	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$5 \$15 \$30	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$10 \$30 \$60	\$10 \$20 \$35	\$10 \$20 \$35	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$5 \$15 \$30	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$10 \$30 \$60	\$10 \$20 \$35	\$10 \$20 \$35	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$10 \$25 \$50	\$10 \$25 \$50
Mail Order 90-day supply	Tier 1 \$10 Tier 2 \$30 Tier 3 \$60	\$10 \$20 \$75	\$20 \$40 \$70	\$20 \$50 \$100	\$20 \$50 \$100	\$25 \$75 \$150	\$25 \$50 \$75	\$25 \$50 \$75	\$25 \$50 \$100	\$20 \$50 \$100	\$20 \$50 \$100	\$25 \$75 \$150	\$25 \$50 \$75	\$25 \$50 \$75	\$25 \$50 \$100	\$20 \$50 \$100	\$20 \$50 \$100	\$25 \$75 \$150	\$25 \$50 \$75	\$25 \$50 \$75	\$25 \$50 \$100	\$25 \$50 \$100	\$25 \$50 \$100	\$25 \$50 \$100

GIC plans are converting to a Medicare PDP effective 1-1-16



WAYLAND - FISCAL YEAR 2016 HEALTH INSURANCE OPTIONS SUMMARY

ALL DATA REPORTED ON AN ANNUAL BASIS
DATA EXCLUDES INCREASED OUT-OF-POCKET EXPENSES

	Employer Cost	Emp/Retiree Cost	Total Cost
Option #1 - Current WSHG Plans			
Non-Medicare Plans	5,744,407	2,944,325	8,688,732
Medicare Plans	664,609	664,609	1,329,218
<u>Total</u>	<u>6,409,016</u>	<u>3,608,934</u>	<u>10,017,950</u>
Option #2 - Move to New WSHG Benchmark Plans			
Non-Medicare Plans	5,353,944	2,745,297	8,099,241
Medicare Plans	664,609	664,609	1,329,218
<u>Total</u>	<u>6,018,553</u>	<u>3,409,906</u>	<u>9,428,459</u>
Savings	390,463	199,028	589,491
Option #3 - Move to GIC Plans; All enroll in Same Carrier using HPHC Independence and Tufts Navigator; BC to Tufts Navigator			
Non-Medicare Plans	5,138,638	2,614,828	7,753,466
Medicare Plans	766,638	766,638	1,533,276
<u>Total</u>	<u>5,905,276</u>	<u>3,381,466</u>	<u>9,286,742</u>
Savings	503,740	227,468	731,208
25% Mitigation	-182,802	182,802	
<u>Net 1st Year Savings</u>	<u>320,938</u>	<u>410,270</u>	<u>731,208</u>
Option #4 - Move to GIC Plans; HP, Tufts, BCBS Enroll in Tufts Navigator; Fallon Enrolls in Fallon			
Non-Medicare Plans	4,779,350	2,428,683	7,208,033
Medicare Plans	766,638	766,638	1,533,276
<u>Total</u>	<u>5,545,988</u>	<u>3,195,321</u>	<u>8,741,309</u>
Savings	863,028	413,613	1,276,641
25% Mitigation	-319,160	319,160	
<u>Net 1st Year Savings</u>	<u>543,868</u>	<u>732,773</u>	<u>1,276,641</u>
Option #5 - Move to GIC Plans; Hybrid Model			
Non-Medicare Plans	4,765,943	2,429,607	7,195,550
Medicare Plans	766,638	766,638	1,533,276
<u>Total</u>	<u>5,532,581</u>	<u>3,196,245</u>	<u>8,728,826</u>
Savings	876,435	412,689	1,289,124
25% Mitigation	-322,281	322,281	
<u>Net 1st Year Savings</u>	<u>554,154</u>	<u>734,970</u>	<u>1,289,124</u>



WAYLAND - FISCAL YEAR 2016 Current WSHG Plans

Plan Name	Enrollment	I/F	# of Months	EMPLOYER			EMPLOYEE/RETIREE		TOTAL Cost	Employer %
				Rate	Share	Cost	Share	Cost		
HPHC PPO	1	I	12	2268.00	1134.00	13,608	1134.00	13,608	27,216	50.00
	1	F	12	5036.00	2518.00	30,216	2518.00	30,216	60,432	50.00
TOTALS:						43,824		43,824	87,648	
HPHC EPO	104	I	12	736.00	544.64	679,711	191.36	238,817	918,528	74.00
RATE SAVER	162	F	12	1918.00	1227.52	2,386,299	690.48	1,342,293	3,728,592	64.00
TOTALS:						3,066,010		1,581,110	4,647,120	
HPHC EPO	2	I	12	736.00	368.00	8,832	368.00	8,832	17,664	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1918.00	959.00	23,016	959.00	23,016	46,032	50.00
TOTALS:						31,848		31,848	63,696	
TUFTS EPO	54	I	12	797.00	589.78	382,177	207.22	134,279	516,456	74.00
RATE SAVER	50	I	12	2088.00	1336.32	801,792	751.68	451,008	1,252,800	64.00
TOTALS:						1,183,969		585,287	1,769,256	
NETWORK BLUE	37	I	12	843.00	623.82	276,976	219.18	97,316	374,292	74.00
RATE SAVER	28	F	12	2261.00	1447.04	486,205	813.96	273,491	759,696	64.00
TOTALS:						763,182		370,806	1,133,988	
FALLON SELECT	32	I	12	611.00	452.14	173,622	158.86	61,002	234,624	74.00
RATE SAVER	24	F	12	1647.00	1054.08	303,575	592.92	170,761	474,336	64.00
TOTALS:						477,197		231,763	708,960	
FALLON SELECT	1	I	12	611.00	305.50	3,666	305.50	3,666	7,332	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1647.00	823.50	19,764	823.50	19,764	39,528	50.00
TOTALS:						23,430		23,430	46,860	
FALLON DIRECT	13	I	12	570.00	421.80	65,801	148.20	23,119	88,920	74.00
RATE SAVER	7	F	12	1531.00	979.84	82,307	551.16	46,297	128,604	64.00
TOTALS:						148,107		69,417	217,524	
FALLON DIRECT	2	I	12	570.00	285.00	6,840	285.00	6,840	13,680	50.00
RATE SAVER	0	F	12	1531.00	765.50	-	765.50	-	-	50.00
TOTALS:						6,840		6,840	13,680	
SUBTOTAL NON-MEDICARE						5,744,407		2,944,325	8,688,732	
MEDEX	87	I	12	340.00	170.00	177,480	170.00	177,480	354,960	50.00
HPHC ENHANCE	93	I	12	328.33	164.17	183,208	164.17	183,208	366,416	50.00
TUFTS MED PLUS	72	I	12	330.00	165.00	142,560	165.00	142,560	285,120	50.00
TUFTS MED PREF	62	I	12	262.00	131.00	97,464	131.00	97,464	194,928	50.00
MGD BLUE FOR SRS	34	I	12	295.63	147.82	60,309	147.82	60,309	120,617	50.00
FALLON SENIOR	2	I	12	299.00	149.50	3,588	149.50	3,588	7,176	50.00
SUBTOTAL MEDICARE:						664,609		664,609	1,329,217	
Budget Totals All Plans:						6,409,015	-	3,608,934	10,017,949	

OPTION #1



WAYLAND - FISCAL YEAR 2016 Projection on New WSHG Benchmark Benefit

Plan Name	Enrollment	I/F	# of Months	EMPLOYER			EMPLOYEE/RETIREE		TOTAL Cost	Employer %
				Rate	Share	Cost	Share	Cost		
HPHC PPO	1	I	12	2268.00	1134.00	13,608	1134.00	13,608	27,216	50.00
	1	F	12	5036.00	2518.00	30,216	2518.00	30,216	60,432	50.00
TOTALS:						43,824		43,824	87,648	
HPHC EPO	104	I	12	681.83	504.55	629,684	177.28	221,240	850,924	74.00
RATE SAVER	162	F	12	1776.84	1137.18	2,210,673	639.66	1,243,504	3,454,177	64.00
TOTALS:						2,840,357		1,464,744	4,305,101	
HPHC EPO	2	I	12	681.83	340.92	8,182	340.92	8,182	16,364	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1776.84	888.42	21,322	888.42	21,322	42,644	50.00
TOTALS:						29,504		29,504	59,008	
TUFTS EPO	54	I	12	734.83	543.77	352,366	191.06	123,804	476,170	74.00
RATE SAVER	50	I	12	1925.14	1232.09	739,254	693.05	415,830	1,155,084	64.00
TOTALS:						1,091,619		539,634	1,631,254	
NETWORK BLUE	37	I	12	799.08	591.32	262,546	207.76	92,246	354,792	74.00
RATE SAVER	28	F	12	2143.20	1371.65	460,874	771.55	259,241	720,115	64.00
TOTALS:						723,419		351,487	1,074,907	
FALLON SELECT	32	I	12	582.71	431.21	165,583	151.50	58,178	223,761	74.00
RATE SAVER	24	F	12	1570.74	1005.27	289,519	565.47	162,854	452,373	64.00
TOTALS:						455,102		221,032	676,134	
FALLON SELECT	1	I	12	582.71	291.36	3,496	291.36	3,496	6,993	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1570.74	785.37	18,849	785.37	18,849	37,698	50.00
TOTALS:						22,345		22,345	44,690	
FALLON DIRECT	13	I	12	543.61	402.27	62,754	141.34	22,049	84,803	74.00
RATE SAVER	7	F	12	1460.11	934.47	78,496	525.64	44,154	122,649	64.00
TOTALS:						141,250		66,203	207,452	
FALLON DIRECT	2	I	12	543.61	271.81	6,523	271.81	6,523	13,047	50.00
RATE SAVER	0	F	12	1460.11	730.06	-	730.06	-	-	50.00
TOTALS:						6,523		6,523	13,047	
SUBTOTAL NON-MEDICARE						5,353,944		2,745,297	8,099,241	
MEDEX	87	I	12	340.00	170.00	177,480	170.00	177,480	354,960	50.00
HPHC ENHANCE	93	I	12	328.33	164.17	183,208	164.17	183,208	366,416	50.00
TUFTS MED PLUS	72	I	12	330.00	165.00	142,560	165.00	142,560	285,120	50.00
TUFTS MED PREF	62	I	12	262.00	131.00	97,464	131.00	97,464	194,928	50.00
MGD BLUE FOR SRS	34	I	12	295.63	147.82	60,309	147.82	60,309	120,617	50.00
FALLON SENIOR	2	I	12	299.00	149.50	3,588	149.50	3,588	7,176	50.00
SUBTOTAL MEDICARE:						664,609		664,609	1,329,217	
Budget Totals All Plans:						6,018,553		3,409,906	9,428,458	
Total Savings from WSHG Current Plans:						390,463		199,028	589,491	

Note: Employee/retiree savings do not reflect increased out-of pocket expenses



WAYLAND - FISCAL YEAR 2016

WSHG TO GIC PLANS - Enroll in Same Carrier, BC to Tufts

Plan Name	Enrollment	I/F	# of Months	Rate	EMPLOYER Share	EMPLOYER Cost	EMPLOYEE/RETIREE Share	EMPLOYEE/RETIREE Cost	TOTAL Cost	Employer %
HPHC PPO	1	I	12	932.32	466.16	5,594	466.16	5,594	11,188	50.00
to Unicare Basic	1	F	12	2183.55	1091.78	13,101	1091.78	13,101	26,203	50.00
TOTALS:						18,695		18,695	37,390	
HPHC EPO	104	I	12	749.39	554.55	692,077	194.84	243,162	935,239	74.00
RATE SAVER	162	F	12	1828.49	1170.23	2,274,934	658.26	1,279,650	3,554,585	64.00
to HPHC Independence	TOTALS:						2,967,011		1,522,813	4,489,823
HPHC EPO	2	I	12	749.39	374.70	8,993	374.70	8,993	17,985	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1828.49	914.25	21,942	914.25	21,942	43,884	50.00
to HPHC Independence	TOTALS:						30,935		30,935	61,869
TUFTS EPO	54	I	12	659.25	487.85	316,124	171.41	111,070	427,194	74.00
RATE SAVER	50	F	12	1609.60	1030.14	618,086	579.46	347,674	965,760	64.00
to Tufts Navigator	TOTALS:						934,210		458,744	1,392,954
NETWORK BLUE	37	I	12	659.25	487.85	216,603	171.41	76,104	292,707	74.00
RATE SAVER	28	F	12	1609.60	1030.14	346,128	579.46	194,697	540,826	64.00
to Tufts Navigator	TOTALS:						562,732		270,801	833,533
FALLON SELECT	32	I	12	654.98	484.69	186,119	170.29	65,393	251,512	74.00
RATE SAVER	24	F	12	1571.91	1006.02	289,734	565.89	162,976	452,710	64.00
to Fallon Select	TOTALS:						475,854		228,369	704,222
FALLON SELECT	1	I	12	654.98	327.49	3,930	327.49	3,930	7,860	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1571.91	785.96	18,863	785.96	18,863	37,726	50.00
to Fallon Select	TOTALS:						22,793		22,793	45,586
FALLON DIRECT	13	I	12	492.89	364.74	56,899	128.15	19,992	76,891	74.00
RATE SAVER	7	F	12	1182.96	757.09	63,596	425.87	35,773	99,369	64.00
to Fallon Direct	TOTALS:						120,495		55,764	176,259
FALLON DIRECT	2	I	12	492.89	246.45	5,915	246.45	5,915	11,829	50.00
RATE SAVER	0	F	12	1182.96	591.48	-	591.48	-	-	50.00
to Fallon Direct	TOTALS:						5,915		5,915	11,829
SUBTOTAL NON-MEDICARE						5,138,638		2,614,828	7,753,466	
MEDEX *	87	I	12	403.98	201.99	210,878	201.99	210,878	421,755	50.00
HPHC ENHANCE	93	I	12	392.24	196.12	218,870	196.12	218,870	437,740	50.00
TUFTS MED PLUS *	72	I	12	403.98	201.99	174,519	201.99	174,519	349,039	50.00
TUFTS MED PREF	62	I	12	275.60	137.80	102,523	137.80	102,523	205,046	50.00
MGD BLUE FOR SRS **	34	I	12	275.60	137.80	56,222	137.80	56,222	112,445	50.00
FALLON SENIOR	2	I	12	302.13	151.07	3,626	151.07	3,626	7,251	50.00
* to Unicare OME										
** to Tufts Med Pref	MEDICARE TOTAL:						766,638		766,638	1,533,276
Budget Totals All Plans:						5,905,276		3,381,466	9,286,742	
Total Savings from WSHG Current Plans:						503,739		227,468	731,207	
25% Mitigation*:						(182,802)		182,802		
Net 1st Year Savings:						320,937		410,270	731,207	

*If negotiating under Sections 21-23, the Town must provide a mitigation fund of up to 25% of the total first year savings.

Note: Employee/retiree savings do not reflect increased out-of pocket expenses

OPTION #3



WAYLAND - FISCAL YEAR 2016 WSHG TO GIC PLANS - HPHC, Tufts and BC Enroll in Tufts

Plan Name	Enrollment	I/F	# of Months	Rate	EMPLOYER Share	EMPLOYER Cost	EMPLOYEE/RETIREE Share	EMPLOYEE/RETIREE Cost	TOTAL Cost	Employer %
HPHC PPO	1	I	12	932.32	466.16	5,594	466.16	5,594	11,188	50.00
to Unicare Basic	1	F	12	2183.55	1091.78	13,101	1091.78	13,101	26,203	50.00
TOTALS:						18,695		18,695	37,390	
HPHC EPO	104	I	12	659.25	487.85	608,831	171.41	213,913	822,744	74.00
RATE SAVER	162	F	12	1609.60	1030.14	2,002,600	579.46	1,126,462	3,129,062	64.00
to Tufts Navigator	TOTALS:						2,611,430		1,340,376	3,951,806
HPHC EPO	2	I	12	659.25	329.63	7,911	329.63	7,911	15,822	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1609.60	804.80	19,315	804.80	19,315	38,630	50.00
to Tufts Navigator	TOTALS:						27,226		27,226	54,452
TUFTS EPO	54	I	12	659.25	487.85	316,124	171.41	111,070	427,194	74.00
RATE SAVER	50	F	12	1609.60	1030.14	618,086	579.46	347,674	965,760	64.00
to Tufts Navigator	TOTALS:						934,210		458,744	1,392,954
NETWORK BLUE	37	I	12	659.25	487.85	216,603	171.41	76,104	292,707	74.00
RATE SAVER	28	F	12	1609.60	1030.14	346,128	579.46	194,697	540,826	64.00
to Tufts Navigator	TOTALS:						562,732		270,801	833,533
FALLON SELECT	32	I	12	654.98	484.69	186,119	170.29	65,393	251,512	74.00
RATE SAVER	24	F	12	1571.91	1006.02	289,734	565.89	162,976	452,710	64.00
to Fallon Select	TOTALS:						475,854		228,369	704,222
FALLON SELECT	1	I	12	654.98	327.49	3,930	327.49	3,930	7,860	50.00
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1571.91	785.96	18,863	785.96	18,863	37,726	50.00
to Fallon Select	TOTALS:						22,793		22,793	45,586
FALLON DIRECT	13	I	12	492.89	364.74	56,899	128.15	19,992	76,891	74.00
RATE SAVER	7	F	12	1182.96	757.09	63,596	425.87	35,773	99,369	64.00
to Fallon Direct	TOTALS:						120,495		55,764	176,259
FALLON DIRECT	2	I	12	492.89	246.45	5,915	246.45	5,915	11,829	50.00
RATE SAVER	0	F	12	1182.96	591.48	-	591.48	-	-	50.00
to Fallon Direct	TOTALS:						5,915		5,915	11,829
SUBTOTAL NON-MEDICARE						4,779,350		2,428,683	7,208,033	
MEDEX *	87	I	12	403.98	201.99	210,878	201.99	210,878	421,755	50.00
HPHC ENHANCE	93	I	12	392.24	196.12	218,870	196.12	218,870	437,740	50.00
TUFTS MED PLUS *	72	I	12	403.98	201.99	174,519	201.99	174,519	349,039	50.00
TUFTS MED PREF	62	I	12	275.60	137.80	102,523	137.80	102,523	205,046	50.00
MGD BLUE FOR SRS **	34	I	12	275.60	137.80	56,222	137.80	56,222	112,445	50.00
FALLON SENIOR	2	I	12	302.13	151.07	3,626	151.07	3,626	7,251	50.00
* to Unicare OME	TOTALS:						766,638		766,638	1,533,276
** to Tufts Med Pref	TOTALS:						766,638		766,638	1,533,276
Budget Totals All Plans:						5,545,988		3,195,321	8,741,309	
Total Savings from WSHG Current Plans:						863,028		413,813	1,276,841	
25% Mitigation*:						(319,160)		319,160		
Net 1st Year Savings:						543,868		732,773	1,276,641	

*If negotiating under Sections 21-23, the Town must provide a mitigation fund of up to 25% of the total first year savings.

Note: Employee/retiree savings do not reflect increased out-of pocket expenses



WAYLAND - FISCAL YEAR 2016
WSHG HPHC TO GIC 3/4 HPHC INDEPENDENCE; 1/4 HPHC PRIMARY CHOICE
WSHG TUFTS TO GIC 3/4TUFTS NAVIGATOR; 1/4 TUFTS SPIRIT
WSHG BCBS TO GIC UNICARE COMMUNITY CHOICE
WSHG FALLON TO GIC FALLON

Plan Name	Enrollment	I/F	# of Months	Rate	EMPLOYER		EMPLOYEE/RETIREE		TOTAL Cost	Employer %	
					Share	Cost	Share	Cost			
HPHC PPO	1	I	12	932.32	468.16	5,594	468.16	5,594	11,188	50.00	
to Unicare Basic	1	F	12	2183.55	1091.78	13,101	1091.78	13,101	26,203	50.00	
TOTALS:						18,695		18,695	37,390		
HPHC EPO	78	I	12	749.39	554.55	519,057	194.84	182,372	701,429	74.00	
RATE SAVER	121	F	12	1828.49	1170.23	1,699,179	658.28	955,788	2,654,967	64.00	
3/4 to HPHC Independence	TOTALS:						2,218,237		1,138,160	3,356,397	
HPHC EPO	26	I	12	599.51	443.64	138,415	155.87	48,632	187,047	74.00	
RATE SAVER	41	F	12	1462.80	936.19	460,606	526.61	259,091	719,698	64.00	
1/4 to HPHC Primary Choice	TOTALS:						599,021		307,723	906,745	
HPHC EPO	2	I	12	749.39	374.70	8,993	374.70	8,993	17,985	50.00	
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1828.49	914.25	21,942	914.25	21,942	43,884	50.00	
to HPHC Independence	TOTALS:						30,935		30,935	61,869	
TUFTS EPO	40	I	12	659.25	487.85	234,166	171.41	82,274	316,440	74.00	
RATE SAVER	37	F	12	1609.60	1030.14	457,384	579.46	257,278	714,662	64.00	
3/4 to Tufts Navigator	TOTALS:						691,550		339,553	1,031,102	
TUFTS EPO	14	I	12	501.40	371.04	62,334	130.36	21,901	84,235	74.00	
RATE SAVER	13	F	12	1207.85	773.02	120,592	434.83	67,833	188,425	64.00	
1/4 to Tufts Spirit	TOTALS:						182,926		89,734	272,660	
NETWORK BLUE	37	I	12	472.29	349.49	155,176	122.80	54,521	209,697	74.00	
RATE SAVER	28	F	12	1136.29	727.23	244,348	409.06	137,446	381,793	64.00	
Unicare Community Choice	TOTALS:						399,523		191,967	591,490	
FALLON SELECT	32	I	12	654.98	484.69	186,119	170.29	65,393	251,512	74.00	
RATE SAVER	24	F	12	1571.91	1006.02	289,734	565.89	162,976	452,710	64.00	
to Fallon Select	TOTALS:						475,854		228,369	704,222	
FALLON SELECT	1	I	12	654.98	327.49	3,930	327.49	3,930	7,860	50.00	
RATE SAVER	2	F	12	1571.91	785.96	18,863	785.96	18,863	37,726	50.00	
to Fallon Select	TOTALS:						22,793		22,793	45,586	
FALLON DIRECT	13	I	12	492.89	364.74	56,899	128.15	19,992	76,891	74.00	
RATE SAVER	7	F	12	1182.96	757.09	63,596	425.87	35,773	99,369	64.00	
to Fallon Direct	TOTALS:						120,495		55,764	176,259	
FALLON DIRECT	2	I	12	492.89	246.45	5,915	246.45	5,915	11,829	50.00	
RATE SAVER	0	F	12	1182.96	591.48	-	591.48	-	-	50.00	
to Fallon Direct	TOTALS:						5,915		5,915	11,829	
SUBTOTAL NON-MEDICARE						4,765,943		2,429,607	7,195,550		
MEDEX *	87	I	12	403.98	201.99	210,878	201.99	210,878	421,755	50.00	
HPHC ENHANCE	93	I	12	392.24	196.12	218,870	196.12	218,870	437,740	50.00	
TUFTS MED PLUS *	72	I	12	403.98	201.99	174,519	201.99	174,519	349,039	50.00	
TUFTS MED PREF	62	I	12	275.60	137.80	102,523	137.80	102,523	205,046	50.00	
MGD BLUE FOR SRS **	34	I	12	275.60	137.80	56,222	137.80	56,222	112,445	50.00	
FALLON SENIOR	2	I	12	302.13	151.07	3,626	151.07	3,626	7,251	50.00	
* to Unicare OME	TOTALS:						766,638		766,638	1,533,276	
** to Tufts Med Pref	TOTALS:						766,638		766,638	1,533,276	
Budget Totals All Plans:						5,532,581		3,196,245	8,728,826		
Total Savings from WSHG Current Plans:						876,435		412,689	1,289,123		
25% Mitigation*:						(322,281)		322,281			
Net 1st Year Savings:						554,154		734,969	1,289,123		

*If negotiating under Sections 21-23, the Town must provide a mitigation fund of up to 25% of the total first year savings.

Note: Employee/retiree savings do not reflect increased out-of-pocket expenses

OPTION #5

Town of Wayland
 Non-Medicare Employee/Retiree Out-of-Pocket Comparison
 WSHG HPHC Rate Saver vs GIC HPHC Independence, Tufts Navigator & HPHC Primary Choice

	* Wide Network Plan *		Out-of-Pocket Difference		* Wide Network Plan		Out-of-Pocket Difference		* Limited Network Plan		Out-of-Pocket Difference	
	WSHG Rate Saver	HPHC Independence	WSHG RSP vs. GIC HP	Independence	WSHG Rate Saver	Tufts Navigator	WSHG RSP vs. GIC Tufts Navigator	Navigator	WSHG Rate Saver	HPHC Primary Choice	WSHG RSP vs. GIC HP Primary Choice	Choice
Example 1 - Family (Annual Costs)												
Premium Share	\$8,280	\$7,896	-\$384	\$900	\$8,280	\$6,948	-\$1,332	\$900	\$8,280	\$6,324	-\$1,956	\$900
Deductible*	\$0	\$900	\$900	\$0	\$0	\$900	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$900	\$900	\$0
4 Primary Care Visits	\$80	\$80	\$0	\$0	\$80	\$80	\$0	\$0	\$80	\$80	\$0	\$0
2 Specialist Visits-tier 2	\$70	\$120	\$50	\$50	\$70	\$120	\$50	\$50	\$70	\$120	\$50	\$50
1 MRI	\$0	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$0	\$100	\$100	\$0	\$0	\$100	\$100	\$0
1 outpatient surgery	\$125	\$250	\$125	\$125	\$125	\$250	\$125	\$125	\$125	\$250	\$125	\$125
3 retail RX-tier 2	\$75	\$90	\$15	\$15	\$75	\$90	\$15	\$15	\$75	\$90	\$15	\$15
2 mail-order RX- tier 1 (annual)	\$160	\$200	\$40	\$40	\$160	\$200	\$40	\$40	\$160	\$200	\$40	\$40
TOTAL	\$8,790	\$9,636	10% (Employee or Retiree Increase)		\$8,790	\$6,688	-1% (Employee or Retiree Decrease)		\$8,790	\$8,064	-9% (Employee or Retiree Decrease)	

*Member does not need to satisfy the deductible for office visits and RX Assumes 3+ family members satisfy deductible (Note: 2 Person Family Deductible is \$600)

	* Wide Network Plan *		Out-of-Pocket Difference		* Wide Network Plan		Out-of-Pocket Difference		* Limited Network Plan		Out-of-Pocket Difference	
	WSHG Rate Saver	HPHC Independence	WSHG RSP vs. GIC HP	Independence	WSHG Rate Saver	Tufts Navigator	WSHG RSP vs. GIC Tufts Navigator	Navigator	WSHG Rate Saver	HPHC Primary Choice	WSHG RSP vs. GIC HP Primary Choice	Choice
Example 2 - Individual (Annual Costs)												
Premium Share	\$2,296	\$2,340	\$44	\$300	\$2,296	\$2,052	-\$244	\$300	\$2,296	\$1,872	-\$424	\$300
Deductible	\$0	\$300	\$300	\$0	\$0	\$300	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$300	\$300	\$0
2 Primary Care Visits	\$40	\$40	\$0	\$0	\$40	\$40	\$0	\$0	\$40	\$40	\$0	\$0
1 Specialist Visits-tier 2	\$35	\$60	\$25	\$25	\$35	\$60	\$25	\$25	\$35	\$60	\$25	\$25
1 MRI	\$0	\$100	\$100	\$100	\$0	\$100	\$100	\$0	\$0	\$100	\$100	\$0
1 outpatient surgery	\$125	\$250	\$125	\$125	\$125	\$250	\$125	\$125	\$125	\$250	\$125	\$125
1 retail RX-tier 2	\$25	\$30	\$5	\$5	\$25	\$30	\$5	\$5	\$25	\$30	\$5	\$5
1 mail-order RX- tier 2 (annual)	\$200	\$300	\$100	\$100	\$200	\$300	\$100	\$100	\$200	\$300	\$100	\$100
TOTAL	\$2,721	\$3,420	26% (Employee or Retiree Increase)		\$2,721	\$3,132	15% (Employee or Retiree Increase)		\$2,721	\$2,952	8% (Employee or Retiree Increase)	

Note: The GIC plans identified above reflect the 3 highest municipal enrollments.

HPHC Independence	21.3%
Tufts Navigator	26.8%
HPHC Primary Choice	10.7%